

Table 3-3: Evaluation of **GROUP 1** (Westerly Access Options - 1A, 1B, 1C, 1D and 4A)

Evaluation Criteria	Option 1A – New Road within Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision	Option 1B – New Road within Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision	Option 1C – New Road within Vacant Land (0-17508) to the north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2 Subdivision	Option 1D-1 – New Road Faith Reformed Church and Black Creek Community Centre	1D-2 - New Road south of Faith Reformed Church	1D-3 - New road through Spring Creek Estates	Option 4A - Widen Baker Road, from Netherby Road to Black Creek Road, to a Four-lane Divided Cross section
Transportation							
Effects on the existing roadway network	Low impact on existing roadway network, one additional intersection required.	Moderate impact on existing roadway network, one additional intersection required. New intersection in close proximity to existing intersection.	High impact on existing roadway network, two additional intersections required. New intersections in close proximity to existing intersections	High impact to existing roadway network, two additional intersections required. One intersection in close proximity to MTO highway access. The proposed location is ±125m south of existing Baker Road, which is less than a typical minimum intersection spacing along arterial roadway of 200m (TAC 9.4.2.1). The spacing between proposed access and QEW S-E/W Off-Ramp taper end is ±170m, and QEW E/W-N On-Ramp taper end is ±60. As Per TAC (section 8.4.3), an access to a crossing road should be a minimum of 400m from the nearest interchange ramp intersection, or a minimum of 150m from the end of the interchange ramp taper.	High impact to existing roadway network, two additional intersections required. One intersection in close proximity to MTO highway access. The proposed location is ±225m south of existing Baker Road, which is more than a typical minimum intersection spacing along arterial roadway of 200m (TAC 9.4.2.1). The spacing between proposed access and QEW S-E/W Off-Ramp taper end is ±55m, and QEW E/W-N On-Ramp taper end is negative 50m. As Per TAC (section 8.4.3), an access to a crossing road should be a minimum of 400m from the nearest interchange ramp intersection, or a minimum of 150m from the end of the interchange ramp taper.	High impact to existing roadway network, two additional intersections required. One intersection in close proximity to MTO highway access. The proposed location is ±225m south of existing Baker Road, which is more than a typical minimum intersection spacing along arterial roadway of 200m (TAC 9.4.2.1). The spacing between proposed access and QEW S-E/W Off-Ramp taper end is ±55m, and QEW E/W-N On-Ramp taper end is negative 50m. As Per TAC (section 8.4.3), an access to a crossing road should be a minimum of 400m from the nearest interchange ramp intersection, or a minimum of 150m from the end of the interchange ramp taper.	Very low impact to existing roadway network, existing roadway potentially be widened on the southside to minimize property impacts. Geometric adjustments will be required at Baker Road and Black Creek Road intersection to match existing.
Ability to meet geometric design guidelines	Low ability to meet design guidelines due to skewed intersections.	High ability to meet design guidelines due to slight skew at one intersection.	Moderate ability to meet design guidelines due to slight skew at one intersection.	Very high ability to meet design guidelines due to no skews at intersections	Very high ability to meet design guidelines due to no skews at intersections	Very high ability to meet design guidelines due to no skews at intersections	Very high ability to meet design guidelines due to no changes required.

Evaluation Criteria	Option 1A – New Road within Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1B – New Road within Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1C – New Road within Vacant Land (0-17508) to the north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2 Subdivision		Option 1D-1 – New Road Faith Reformed Church and Black Creek Community Centre		1D-2 - New Road south of Faith Reformed Church		1D-3 - New road through Spring Creek Estates		Option 4A - Widen Baker Road, from Netherby Road to Black Creek Road, to a Four-lane Divided Cross section	
Effects on travel time (i.e., increased or decreased travel time) in the even of closure of Baker Road	Low increase in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Moderate increase in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Low decrease in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Low increase in out of way travel if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Low increase in out of way travel if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Moderate increase in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Very low increase in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road, additional lanes will alleviate any traffic or maintenance issues.	
Social Environment														
Effects on existing private properties	This option will require complete buyout of one residential property with an existing residence. Additional private property area (approximately 262 sq-m) will also be required. In addition, there may be loss of property value of the property located on the east side of Black Creek Road, due to close proximity to the new access road		Approximately 2,400 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, residents may have concerns about potential loss of property value of the property located on the west side of Black Creek Road, due to close proximity to the new access road		This option will require complete buyout of the vacant land (0-17508) located on north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2. In addition, residents may have concerns about potential loss of property value of the property located on the west side of Black Creek Road, due to close proximity to the new access road		Approximately 3,900 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, this option will bisect the commercial property (currently undeveloped) located on the west side of Faith Reformed Church, which may result in loss of property value.		Approximately 3,900 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, this option will impact currently an undeveloped property designated as Medium Density land use on the south side of Faith Reformed Church, which may result in loss of property value.		Approximately 4,300 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, this option will impact two currently undeveloped properties, one of them is designated as a Medium and other as a Low density land use on the south side of Faith Reformed Church, which may result in loss of property value.		Approximately 1,400 Sq m of private property area will be required. The road widening needs to be shifted south to avoid potential property buy-out and impact to new residences at northwest quadrant of Baker Road/Black Creek Road intersection.	
Effects on or compatibility with future land use/development	A portion of this option is not compatible with the future land use. The west portion of this option will take a small portion of the lands that are proposed to be converted into a stormwater management pond (Block 141) as part of Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision. The remaining portion of this alternative will align with the roadway that was identified as part of the Draft Plan		A portion of this option is not compatible with the future land use. The north-east portion of this option will take a significant portion of the lands that are proposed to be converted into a stormwater management pond (Block 142) as part of Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision. The remaining portion of this alternative will align with the roadway that was identified as		This option will not interfere with the proposed future development		This option will interfere with the proposed future development on the west side of Faith Reformed Church, resulting in potential loss of property value.		This option will interfere with the proposed future development on the south side of Faith Reformed Church, resulting in potential loss of property value.		This option will interfere with the proposed future development on the south side of Faith Reformed Church, resulting in potential loss of property value.		This option will not interfere with the proposed future development	

Evaluation Criteria	Option 1A – New Road within Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1B – New Road within Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1C – New Road within Vacant Land (0-17508) to the north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2 Subdivision		Option 1D-1 – New Road Faith Reformed Church and Black Creek Community Centre		1D-2 - New Road south of Faith Reformed Church		1D-3 - New road through Spring Creek Estates		Option 4A - Widen Baker Road, from Netherby Road to Black Creek Road, to a Four-lane Divided Cross section	
	of Subdivision as part of the Planning Act process.		part of the Draft Plan of Subdivision as part of the Planning Act process.											
Natural Environment														
Effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	●
Effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	Minor effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas) (i.e., minor removal of vegetation and trees)	◐	Significant effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas) (i.e., significant removal of vegetation and trees)	○	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●
Effects on Species at Risk	No potential for effects on Species at Risk	●	Potential for minor effects on Species at Risk due to removal of some vegetation and trees	◐	Potential for significant effects on Species at Risk due to removal of some vegetation and trees	○	No potential for effects on Species at Risk	●	No potential for effects on Species at Risk	●	No potential for effects on Species at Risk	●	No potential for effects on Species at Risk	●
Effects on fish and aquatic habitat	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●	No effects on fish and aquatic habitat	●
Cultural Environment														
Effects on lands with archaeological potential	No effects are anticipated on archaeological resources, as the Lands within Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision are under construction	●	No effects on archaeological resources are anticipated as the lands within Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision are assumed to have been assessed through archaeological assessment(s)	●	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐
Effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes are anticipated	●	Significant effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas) (i.e., significant removal of	○	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●

Evaluation Criteria	Option 1A – New Road within Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1B – New Road within Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1C – New Road within Vacant Land (0-17508) to the north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2 Subdivision		Option 1D-1 – New Road Faith Reformed Church and Black Creek Community Centre		1D-2 - New Road south of Faith Reformed Church		1D-3 - New road through Spring Creek Estates		Option 4A - Widen Baker Road, from Netherby Road to Black Creek Road, to a Four-lane Divided Cross section	
					vegetation and trees). Indigenous Nations consider natural features as cultural heritage									
Engineering														
Effects on existing and/or proposed infrastructure/utilities	The west portion of this option will take a small portion of the lands that are proposed to be converted into a stormwater management pond (Block 141) as part of Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision	○	The north-east portion of this option will take a significant portion of the lands that are proposed to be converted into a stormwater management pond (Block 142) as part of Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision	○	This option appears to be encroaching into an existing utility corridor, further details needs to be confirmed by field investigation.	◐	This option may require relocation of any buried infrastructure that may be located at this property	◐	This option may require relocation of any buried infrastructure that may be located at this property	◐	This option may require relocation of any buried infrastructure that may be located at this property	◐	There are hydro poles located on both sides of Baker Road. In addition, there may be underground utilities. Relocation of the aboveground and underground utilities will be required	◐
Complexity of construction, including staging and traffic disruption during construction	Very low complexity of construction due to minimal impact on existing traffic and simple construction environment. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	●	Low complexity of construction due to minimal impact on existing traffic. One intersection is in close proximity to Black Creek. Draft plan of subdivision revision. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	◐	Low complexity of construction due to minimal impact on existing traffic. One intersection is in close proximity to Black Creek. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	◐	Very low complexity of construction due to minimal impact on existing traffic and simple construction environment. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	●	Very low complexity of construction due to minimal impact on existing traffic and simple construction environment. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	●	Very low complexity of construction due to minimal impact on existing traffic and simple construction environment. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	●	Low complexity of construction due to simple construction environment. Minor impact on existing traffic with construction staging required. Schedule B or C Class EA would be required, depending on property costs.	◐
Economic Environment														
Cost to acquire private properties (complete buyout or portion of properties)	Very high property acquisition costs due to purchase of one residential property with an existing residence, and additional private property (approximately 262 Sq m)	○	Moderate property acquisition costs (approximately 2,400 Sq m)	◐	Very High property acquisition costs due to purchase of the vacant land (0-17508) located on north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2	○	Approximately 3,900 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, this option will bisect the commercial property (currently undeveloped) located on the west side of Faith Reformed Church, which may	◐	Approximately 3,900 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, this option will impact currently an undeveloped property designated as Medium Density land use on the south side of Faith Reformed Church, which may	◐	Approximately 4,300 sq-m of private property area will be required. In addition, this option will impact two currently undeveloped properties, one of them is designated as a Medium and other as a Low density land use on the south side of Faith Reformed	◐	Low property acquisition costs due to purchase of approximately 1,400 sq m of private property	◐

Evaluation Criteria	Option 1A – New Road within Phase 1 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1B – New Road within Phase 2 of Black Creek Signature Subdivision		Option 1C – New Road within Vacant Land (0-17508) to the north side of Black Creek Signature Phase 2 Subdivision		Option 1D-1 – New Road Faith Reformed Church and Black Creek Community Centre		1D-2 - New Road south of Faith Reformed Church		1D-3 - New road through Spring Creek Estates		Option 4A - Widen Baker Road, from Netherby Road to Black Creek Road, to a Four-lane Divided Cross section	
							result in loss of property value.		result in loss of property value.		Church, which may result in loss of property value.			
Cost to construct	Potential cost of road construction could be \$380,000 approximately.		Potential cost of road construction could be \$440,000 approximately.		Potential cost of road construction could be \$610,000 approximately.		Potential cost of road construction could be \$460,000 approximately.		Potential cost of road construction could be \$460,000 approximately.		Potential cost of road construction could be \$450,000 approximately.		Potential cost of road construction could be \$590,000 approximately.	
Total Score		39		39		28		44		43		42		53

Table 3-4: Evaluation of GROUP 2 (Easterly Access Options - 2A, 2B, 2C, 2D, and 3A)

Evaluation Criteria	Option 2A – Extending Baker Road from River Trail to Switch Road		Option 2B – At Terranet Parcel 642400122 Opposite Sewage Pump Station		Option 2C – Extending Canfield Crescent easterly		Option 2D – Extending River Trail Crescent easterly		Option 3A – Extend Black Creek Road in a southeast direction and connect with Shagbark Lane	
Transportation										
Effects on the existing roadway network	Low impact on existing roadway network, one additional intersection required.		Moderate impact on existing roadway network, two additional intersections are required.		Low impact on existing roadway network, one additional intersection required.		High impact to existing roadway network, two additional intersections required. One intersection in very close proximity to existing intersection.		Very low impact on existing roadway network, no additional intersections required.	
Ability to meet geometric design guidelines	Very high ability to meet design guidelines due to no intersection skews.		Low ability to meet design guidelines due to slight skews at both intersections, as well as poor sightlines		Moderate ability to meet design guidelines due to poor to average sightlines at one intersection.		High ability to meet design guidelines due to no skews at intersections		Moderate ability to meet design guidelines due poor sightlines near existing Black Creek Road and River Trail intersection.	
Effects on travel time (i.e., increased or decreased travel time) in the even of closure of Baker Road	Very low decrease in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Low decrease in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Low decrease in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Moderate decrease in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.		Moderate decrease in travel time if issues occur at Baker Road access.	
Social Environment										
Effects on existing private properties	This option will require complete buyout of two (2) residential properties with existing residences. Additional private property area (approximately 1,100 Sq m) will also be required at the easterly limit.		Private property (approximately 350 Sq m) will be required.		This option will require purchase of three (3) residential properties with existing residences. Additional private property (approximately 600 Sq m) will also be required		This option will require purchase of two residential properties, one of them has an existing residence and the other one is undeveloped. Additional private property (approximately 9,100 Sq m) will also be required. There may also be loss of property value of at least one property due to severance.		This option will require complete buyout of one (1) existing residential property (3386 Black Creek Road).	
Effects on or compatibility with future land use/development	This option is located in an area of existing development. No effects on future development are anticipated		This option is located in an area of existing development. No effects on future development are anticipated		This option is located in an area of existing development. No effects on future development are anticipated		This option is partially located on an undeveloped residential property, and will likely impact future development plan for that property, if development on that property is proposed		This option will not interfere with the future development	
Natural Environment										
Effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	This option crosses Black Creek, which is identified as Environmental Protection Area (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural		This option crosses Black Creek, which is identified as Environmental Protection Area (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards) on the Secondary		This option crosses Black Creek, which is identified as Environmental Protection Area (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards) on the Secondary Plan. A structure will be required to cross		This option crosses Black Creek, which is identified as Environmental Protection Area (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards) on the Secondary		This option crosses Black Creek. In addition, a retaining wall will potentially be required in close proximity of the creek. Significant effects on Environmental Protection	

Evaluation Criteria	Option 2A – Extending Baker Road from River Trail to Switch Road		Option 2B – At Terranet Parcel 642400122 Opposite Sewage Pump Station		Option 2C – Extending Canfield Crescent easterly		Option 2D – Extending River Trail Crescent easterly		Option 3A – Extend Black Creek Road in a southeast direction and connect with Shagbark Lane	
	Hazards) on the Secondary Plan. A structure will be required to cross Black Creek. Consultation with the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority would be required to understand requirements for any technical investigations that may be required due to the crossing of Black Creek PSW and Natural Hazards		Plan. A structure will be required to cross Black Creek. Consultation with the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority would be required to understand requirements for any technical investigations that may be required due to the crossing of Black Creek PSW and Natural Hazards		Black Creek. Consultation with the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority would be required to understand requirements for any technical investigations that may be required due to the crossing of Black Creek PSW and Natural Hazards		Plan. A structure will be required to cross Black Creek. Consultation with the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority would be required to understand requirements for any technical investigations that may be required due to the crossing of Black Creek PSW and Natural Hazards		Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands). Consultation with the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority would be required to understand requirements for any technical investigations that may be required due to the crossing of Black Creek PSW and Natural Hazards	
Effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	●
Effects on Species at Risk	Moderate potential for effects on Species at Risk (e.g., Snapping Turtle)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on Species at Risk (e.g., Snapping Turtle)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on Species at Risk (e.g., Snapping Turtle)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on Species at Risk (e.g., Snapping Turtle)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on Species at Risk (e.g., Snapping Turtle)	◐
Effects on fish and fish habitat (including Species at Risk)	Moderate potential for effects on fish and fish habitat (including aquatic Species at Risk)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on fish and fish habitat (including aquatic Species at Risk)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on fish and fish habitat (including aquatic Species at Risk)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on fish and fish habitat (including aquatic Species at Risk)	◐	Moderate potential for effects on fish and fish habitat (including aquatic Species at Risk)	◐
Cultural Environment										
Effects on lands identified to retain potential archaeological resources	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan does not identify areas of archaeological potential on lands associated with this option. No Archaeological Assessment will be required	●	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan does not identify areas of archaeological potential on lands associated with this option. No Archaeological Assessment will be required	●	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan does not identify areas of archaeological potential on lands associated with this option. No Archaeological Assessment will be required	●	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify a portion of the lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	◐
Effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	●	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes are anticipated	●
Engineering										
Effects on existing and/or proposed infrastructure/utilities	There is a hydro pole located at Baker Road/River Trail intersection. In addition, there may be	◐	There is a storm water outfall located on the east side of River Trail, approximately 300 metres south of Baker Road. This road access	○	This option may require relocation of any buried infrastructure	◐	This option may require relocation of any buried infrastructure	◐	This option may require relocation of any buried infrastructure	◐

Evaluation Criteria	Option 2A – Extending Baker Road from River Trail to Switch Road		Option 2B – At Terranet Parcel 642400122 Opposite Sewage Pump Station		Option 2C – Extending Canfield Crescent easterly		Option 2D – Extending River Trail Crescent easterly		Option 3A – Extend Black Creek Road in a southeast direction and connect with Shagbark Lane	
	underground utilities. Relocation of the aboveground and underground utilities will be required		option is not feasible, as it would require relocation of the outfall, which may not be possible, given the developed nature of the area. Building around the outfall will also not be feasible as it will have wider impact footprint and may require wider bridge crossing or two separate structures over the creek.							
Complexity of construction, including staging and traffic disruption during construction	High complexity of construction due to bridge construction over creek. Schedule C Class EA would be required.		Very high complexity of construction due to bridge construction over creek. Schedule C Class EA would be required.		High complexity of construction due to bridge construction over creek. Schedule C Class EA would be required.		High complexity of construction due to bridge construction over creek. Schedule C Class EA would be required.		Very high complexity of construction due to bridge construction over creek. A large portion of the road will run adjacent to the creek, creating further structural design considerations. Schedule C Class EA would be required.	
Economic Environment										
Cost to acquire private properties (complete buyout or portion of properties)	Very high property acquisition costs due to purchase of two residential property with an existing residence, and additional private property (approximately 1,100 Sq m)		Moderate property acquisition costs due to purchase of approximately 3,150 Sq m of private property		Very high property acquisition costs due to purchase of three residential property with an existing residence, and additional private property (approximately 600 Sq m)		Very high property acquisition costs due to purchase of two residential property with an existing residence, and additional private property (approximately 9,200 Sq m)		Moderate property acquisition costs due to purchase of one residential property with an existing residence.	
Cost to construct	Potential cost of road construction could be \$790,000 approximately based on \$150 per linear meter. Additionally, the cost of bridge structure at creek crossing would be approximately \$3.195M based on \$4500/sq-meter. Total road plus bridge construction cost estimate is \$3.99M		Potential cost of road construction could be \$360,000 approximately based on \$70 per linear meter. Additionally, the cost of bridge structure at creek crossing would be approximately \$3.78M based on \$4500/sq-meter. Total road plus bridge construction cost estimate is \$4.14M		Potential cost of road construction could be \$560,000 approximately based on \$110 per linear meter. Additionally, the cost of bridge structure at creek crossing would be approximately \$3.3M based on \$4500/sq-meter. Total road plus bridge construction cost estimate is \$3.86M		Potential cost of road construction could be \$810,000 approximately based on \$160 per linear meter. Additionally, the cost of bridge structure at creek crossing would be approximately \$5.0M based on \$4500/sq-meter. Total road plus bridge construction cost estimate is \$5.81M		Potential cost of road construction could be \$1.17M approximately based on \$230 per linear meter. Additionally, the cost of bridge structure at creek crossing would be approximately \$5.2M based on \$4500/sq-meter. Total road plus bridge construction cost estimate is \$6.37M	
Total Score		32		30		31		27		31

Table 3-5: Evaluation of **GROUP 3** (Southerly Access Option - 5A)

Evaluation Criteria	Option 5A – Extend Black Creek Road, over the QEW, to connect with Townline Road.	
Transportation		
Effects on the existing roadway network	High impact on existing roadway network, one additional intersection required. One intersection will require reconfiguration or changed to a cul-de-sac. Will provide a more direct connection between Douglas Town and commercial area.	
Ability to meet geometric design guidelines	Very high ability to meet design guidelines due to no intersection skews.	
Effects on travel time (i.e., increased or decreased travel time) in the even of closure of Baker Road	High decrease in travel time if issues at Baker Road access.	
Social Environment		
Effects on existing private properties	This option will require complete buyout of six residential properties with existing residences. Additional private property area (approximately 275 Sq m) will also be required	
Effects on or compatibility with future land use/development	This option may interfere with the proposed future development on the enhanced commercial property located on the south side of QEW, resulting in potential loss of property value. No development application(s) were made available for that property at the time of preparation of this document.	
Natural Environment		
Effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	No effects on Environmental Protection Areas (Provincially Significant Wetlands and Natural Hazards)	
Effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	No effects on Environmental Conservation Overlay (Wooded Areas)	
Effects on Species at Risk	Moderate potential for effects on Species at Risk (e.g., Snapping Turtle)	
Effects on fish and aquatic habitat	No effects on fish and fish habitat (including aquatic Species at Risk)	
Cultural Environment		
Effects on lands identified to retain potential archaeological resources	Schedule 'D' of the Town's Official Plan identify lands associated with this option as areas of archaeological potential. Archaeological Assessment will be required	
Effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes	No effects on built heritage and cultural heritage landscapes are anticipated	
Engineering		
Effects on existing and/or proposed utilities	There are underground utilities, which will require relocation due to additional fill to accommodate the bridge crossing over the highway. Relocation of the aboveground and underground utilities will likely be required	
Complexity of construction, including staging and traffic disruption during construction	High complexity of construction due to bridge construction over highway. Schedule C Class EA would be required.	
Economic Environment		
Cost to acquire private properties (complete buyout or portion of properties)	Very high property acquisition costs due to purchase of six residential property with an existing residence, and additional private property (approximately 0.28 hectares). Costs to redesign lot layout for Spring Creeks Development.	
Cost to construct	Potential cost of road construction could be \$ 900 000 approximately based on \$180 per linear meter. Additionally, the cost of bridge structure at highway crossing would be \$17.6M based on \$4500/sq-meter. Total road plus bridge construction cost estimate is \$18.5M	
Total Score		30